

Room to Grow

The Experience of Immigrant Artists in Halifax

Ben Buckwold

Master of Planning Candidate

Plan 6000: Masters planning project

Dec 8, 2010

Project advisor: Dr. Jill Grant

Course instructor: Patricia Manuel

Abstract

This case study explores the experiences and opinions of Halifax-based immigrants who are professional artists. The objective of the research is to learn about perceived and encountered advantages and disadvantages of pursuing artistic work in Halifax in order to understand Immigrants' integration experiences, to inform municipal objectives to diversify the cultural industry, and to explore theories about the cultural industries. The primary information sources for the study are the transcripts of 30 semi-structured interviews with Halifax-based immigrant artists, including dancers, visual artists, and musicians.

The immigrant artist interviews suggest that a combination of social, demographic, and economic factors make Halifax an enabling yet challenging environment for immigrants working or trying to work as dancers, musicians, and artists. Working in a smaller city provides artists with the opportunity to shape the market, but the overall opportunities may be low. Being successful appears to require entrepreneurial skills. Social capital is an important asset for artists in Halifax; however, gaining access to such capital can be challenging. Although immigrant artists can benefit Halifax's cultural economy by encouraging innovation, immigrants entering the cultural sector may face an insecure career position. If the municipality wishes to diversify the cultural industries through integrating immigrant artists it should do so through policy mechanisms which help to connect immigrant artists with tangible career opportunities.

Introduction

Artists have been receiving attention lately from municipal politicians and planners. Many political actors have bought in wholesale to Richard Florida's claim that innovative and creative workers who drive today's knowledge based economies are drawn to hip lifestyle offerings rather than employment opportunities (Florida 2002, Florida 2005, Peck 2005). Municipalities competing for Florida's "creative class" are motivated by the belief that artists contribute to progressive place making and place marketing (Florida 2002, Florida 2005). Not only are artists valued as contributors to urban lifestyle quality, they are considered to be part of Florida's "super creative core" of talented workers (Florida 2002). Other research adds neighbourhood revitalization and economic multiplier effects to the list of urban development benefits attributed to artists (Markusen 2006). In this political climate of hip boosterism, cultivating dynamic cultural sectors and cultural attractions has become a veritable silver bullet for economic growth and urban regeneration.

Halifax has joined the swelling ranks of cities that are adopting cultural development policies as components of their place making and place marketing strategies. Halifax Regional Municipality's cultural development plan makes it clear that investing in the arts is not simply a matter of supporting culture for culture's sake (HRM 2006). The economic development plan draws heavily on Florida's rhetoric to promote the city and to convey its intention to create a vibrant cultural sector (HRM 2005). HRM policy indicates that there are social and economic agendas to promote cultural diversity in the city (HRM 2006, HRM 2006). Halifax's cultural development plan outlines social and economic values of cultural diversity stating, that is "integral to the healthy and progressive community and regional development" (HRM 2006, pp.14). This statement and others indicate that immigration will provide a valued contribution to the development of culture in the city. Although no HRM policy document states that attracting immigrant artists is a recognized strategy for achieving any of the City's various cultural development objectives there are several reasons to believe that immigrant artists could play a multipurpose role in reaching some of these goals.

Cultural development planning depends upon a city's ability to support its artist community. This leaves cultural planners with two alternatives: raising artists and attracting artists to the city. While supporting local talent is fundamentally important, attracting artists from abroad has appeal that seems to support the city's planning objectives. International talent could be valuable to Halifax's cultural industries for several reasons. The first relates to the City's general demographic need for immigrants in all employment sectors. These pervasive demands are highlighted in research and published in the City's own planning documents (HRM 2005, GHP 2005). A second incentive for Halifax to look across the nation's borders for culture sector workers is bolstered by theory that advocates a diverse workforce for supporting and fostering requisite creativity in knowledge based industries (Florida 2002, Florida 2005, Smallbone et al 2005, Wood and Landry 2008). Supporting cultural diversity through the arts is considered another worthy reason to bring in artists from abroad (Wood and Landry 2008). Although none of this theoretical support for diversity is directly linked to immigrant artists in HRM planning documents, it reflects the values of the City's economic development, immigration, and cultural development strategies.

Understanding artists' location choices and the functional properties of cultural industries are an essential part of determining how a city can attract and retain artist. Due to the popularity of place based urban development strategies there has been a large amount of research done on the economic geography of cultural industries (Currid and Williams 2010, Currid and Connolly 2008, Markusen and Schrock 2006, Leslie 2006, Scott 2007, Scott 2006.). There has also been research done on the location decisions that motivate artist migration (Bennet 2010, Grant et al 2009, Grant and Kronstal 2010, Markusen 2006).

Research on creative professionals and cognitive industries in general also provides some context for this inquiry (Florida 2002, Florida 2005). All of this research has developed theories that are important to consider in this context. Although it has been suggested that Florida's general theories about cognitive industries and their workers are less directly applicable to the study of artists (Markusen 2006) they must be considered due to their influence upon urban development policies.

Much of the research on the organization of cultural industries indicates that the most productive conditions for cultural work exist in large dense urban centres (Currid and Williams 2010, Currid and Connolly 2008, Markusen and Schrock 2006). Spatial analyses have shown that cultural industries tend to form dense agglomerations of factors in production nodes within large urban areas (Currid and Williams 2010, Currid and Connolly 2008). This indicates that artists and the industries that support them benefit from coming together.

Several researchers make similar suggestions to explain the agglomeration of artists in large urban centres (Currid and Connolly 2008, Currid and Williams 2010, Markusen and Schrock 2006). The relatively informal nature of artistic work makes it important for artists to be in close proximity to each other and industry members. Informal interactions, being seen and bumping into people, facilitate professional development through peer interaction and create access to industry opportunities held by gatekeepers such as gallery owners (Currid and Connolly 2008, Currid and Williams 2010, Leslie 2006, Markusen and Schrock 2006). Locating in larger centres is also attractive because of the access to a larger and wealthier market (Markusen 2006). Finally, although some artists are more easily able to export their products, performers often require immediate access to consumers and industry members for work evaluation and consumption.

Migration patterns of artists appear to substantiate the proposed advantages of large urban centres. Research in the United States indicates that mega centres receive most artists who migrate (Markusen 2006). Bennet (2010) suggests that artists migrate for career reasons based on the perception of opportunity rather than actual job offers. This type of decision making appears to favour the more visible larger centres. However, second-tier cities can also provide advantages in the form of unique support networks such as artist run centres (Markusen and Johnson 2006) or less formal social arrangements created within the artistic community (Grant et al 2009, Grant and Kronstal 2010).

Although the primacy of urban centres is evident, artists may also be attracted to relatively isolated areas where they can pursue their creative goals in peace (Gibson, Luckman, Willoughby-Smith, 2010). Some artists have indicated that being outside of dominant cultural centres' spheres of influence improves their opportunities for creative independence and provides an environment with fewer distractions.

General research on creative work takes several different positions and has been the subject of considerable debate. Some researchers reject Florida's

'creative class' theories and insist that creative workers are attracted to jobs (Peck 2005, Scott 2006). Advocates of traditional development approaches suggest that cities should focus on developing industry rather than chasing workers (Peck 2005, Scott 2006). However, the place based attraction theories made popular by Florida have become very influential in urban economic development policies (Florida 2002, Florida 2005). These theories suggest that creative people are attracted to tolerant environments. Tolerant environments are indicated by the presence of bohemians (artistic types), number of foreign born members of the population, and the size of the gay population (Florida 2002).

Halifax's mid-sized status does not allow it to compete directly with larger cultural centres. Statistics reveal that in 2001 artists working in the Atlantic Provinces had 30 percent lower incomes than the national average. Yet despite the apparent financial limitations, research within Halifax's music sector has found that local musicians are attracted to working in the city (Grant, Haggett, and Morton 2009). Halifax based musicians value the supportive of relationships and the face-to-face interactions that come along with working in a smaller community. Supportive social dynamics in Halifax's creative industries might be facilitated by the relatively homogenous demographics of the city's residents (Grant and Kronstal 2010). As Putnam (2007) notes, social capital may be inversely related to ethnic and cultural diversity.

Theories regarding the economic benefits of social capital have implications for the ability of Halifax to provide an enabling environment for immigrant artists. Researchers have substantiated Putnam's theories that social capital creates economic benefits by providing informal organizations of people that can act as both ladders of mobility and as substitutes for more formal institutions (Hoyman and Faricy 2009, Thomas and Darnton 2006). Although they appear to provide tangible benefits, strong communities have been associated with social issues: they can be exclusionary, and may inhibit innovation because they tend to be static (Florida 2002, Hoyman and Faricy 2009, Thomas and Darnton 2006). These findings suggest that areas with high social capital like Halifax might restrict opportunities for newcomers to integrate. At the same time if newcomers are given access to social capital, there is an opportunity for highly positive integration experiences.

Nova Scotia is not a diverse population in terms of the numbers of foreign born people who call the region home. Halifax has been unable to meet its immigration targets, and studies have shown a downward trend in performance (Gertler and Vinodrai 2004, HRM 2005). Demographic homogeneity is reflected in Halifax's artistic community. A 2001 study ranked the Maritimes as the Canadian region with the second lowest proportion of immigrant artists within the total population of artists (Hill Strategies 2005).

The evident lack of diversity considered in light of the dynamics of social capital in the city appear to have the potential to affect the integration experiences of immigrant artists within Halifax's cultural industries. The

importance of networking to artistic work in Halifax and elsewhere implies that poor integration experiences could cut immigrant artists off from critical career opportunities. Accusations of discriminatory behaviour in Halifax's workforce evince social tensions in the city (Cassin & Divine 2006). This suggests that socio-cultural stratification could be contributing to the city's comparatively poor record of immigrant attraction, retention and workforce integration.

The concerns raised about the ability of Halifax to provide an attractive relationship for immigrant artists warrant further investigation. Gaining the perspectives of immigrant artists can help shed light on what is actually happening regarding the advantages and disadvantages of working as a foreign born artist in Halifax. Obtaining this information can help guide policy formation related to the city's economic, social and cultural development objectives.

Research Question

What do the experiences and opinions of immigrant artists indicate are the professional advantages and disadvantages of pursuing careers in Halifax?

Purpose

The purpose of this research is to identify the advantages and disadvantages of pursuing a career in Halifax as an immigrant artist. This information will be used to accomplish three objectives: to evaluate the integration experiences of the study participants, to inform municipal policy, and to explore theories about cultural and creative economies.

Method

This project is a case study of the experiences of professional immigrant artists within Halifax's cultural industries. The case study method has been identified as a useful tool for exploratory and explanatory research into social phenomena (Yin 2009). It allows the researcher to ask questions about how a particular process or phenomenon is operating and to investigate issues that are poorly understood and recognized to depend on context (Yin 2009). This case study is both exploratory and explanatory because little is known about the operation of the social process in question and the context of the research is unique.

The case study is a qualitative research method that can be used to understand a social process by exploring the lived experience of participants influenced by or influencing a social phenomenon or 'case' (Yin 2009). The social phenomenon under investigation in this case is the integration experience of professional immigrant artists within Halifax's cultural industries. As an

exploration of experiences the research subject matter is the subjective interpretations and perceptions of the study's participants.

The primary data for this study comes from semi-structured interviews with professional immigrant artists in Halifax. The interviews were conducted as part of a study (directed by Dr. Jill Grant) that is investigating factors affecting Halifax's ability to attract and retain immigrant artists.

The semi-structured interview method used in this study is a qualitative technique (Dunn 2005). This strategy is to structure interviews in order to obtain particular content while retaining enough flexibility to incorporate and explore unanticipated material (Dunn 2005). The interview is guided by a schedule of predetermined questions and subjects relevant to the topic, but participants' responses may be explored spontaneously at the discretion of the interviewer as relevant issues are raised. The questions asked are open ended and intended to allow participants latitude for discussion while ensuring that relevant information is obtained.

Sample Characteristics

Interview participants were recruited through purposive, snowball, and convenience sampling methods. Selection criteria were to recruit visual artists, dancers and musicians who had immigrated to Canada and were currently practicing in some professional capacity within the Halifax region. Participants were identified through media sources, contact with various organizations that support local artists, settlement service agencies, and the suggestions of interviewees.

Information was gathered through 30 semi-structured interviews with 32 immigrant artists including eleven musicians, four dancers, and seventeen visual artists. The nature of artistic work practiced by the participants varied significantly in regards to genre, level, and source of compensation for artistic work, and level of commitment to professional artistic careers. While some of the participants earned a living or obtained a partial income by marketing their trade others were compensated as members of institutional art programs or as educators. A few participants were no longer actively pursuing careers as artists, were new to the arts, or had other primary financial sources such as spouses or previous employment earnings.

The demographic characteristics of the participants were diverse. Participants differed by age, ethnicity, race, gender, and immigration status. Three of the participants lived outside the HRM, although all of them had worked or continued to work with organizations operating within Halifax. One of the respondents turned out to be a Canadian born outside of the country who spent the majority of his career outside of Canada. At least one respondent has left Halifax since the interview occurred. Sixteen men and sixteen women

participated in the interviews. Each interview was recorded and transcribed to allow for detailed analysis of the content.

Interview Protocol

The interviews were structured by several fundamental questions directed at identifying policy challenges and opportunities associated with attracting and retaining cultural sector workers in Halifax.

- Why do immigrant artists come to (and leave) the Halifax region?
- How welcome do they feel here?
- What does Halifax offer their careers as artists?
- What are the limitations and challenges of pursuing careers while settling in Halifax?
- How does being an immigrant artist affect career opportunities?
- How well do existing programs fulfill the needs of immigrant cultural workers?
- What improvements could be made to service provision to make the region more attractive and enabling to cultural workers from abroad?

Process of Analysis

The data was analyzed using a discourse analysis method. This technique is used to learn about social phenomenon through critically evaluating language by analyzing how the subject is discussed and what is included in the discourse (Fairclough 2003). This technique views discourse as the product of both social actors and social systems (Fairclough 2003). The intent is to learn about how actors producing the discourse are positioned within the social system, either as agents of influence or objects affected by social processes. Utilizing this method of analysis the researcher can learn how social processes are represented and created through discourse and the role of social actors involved.

Findings

The study's findings are presented in two sections. The first considers the professional integration experiences of immigrant artists in Halifax. The second deals more generally with the advantages and disadvantages of working in Halifax as an immigrant artist.

Section 1: The Integration Experiences of Halifax's Immigrant Artists

Most respondents felt that the people of Halifax were overwhelmingly friendly and welcoming. 'The people' were frequently mentioned as one of the most attractive things about Halifax. Many interviewees were impressed by the city's conviviality and told personal stories about this. Generally, Canada was considered to be a more welcoming place for immigrants than other parts of the world.

In addition to positive experiences with the community at large, many of the respondents felt that Halifax's art world was welcoming and supportive, at least in comparison with other places they knew. Art environments were usually seen as competitive and relatively exclusive everywhere. Although many of the respondents had experienced competitive behavior in Halifax, few felt that animosity or uncooperative behaviour in Halifax's art world was novel or extreme and some said that it was less pronounced than elsewhere. Mention of overt racism or ethnocentrism within the artistic community was extremely rare. Generally, being a part of a supportive community and accessible community of artists was highly valued by many respondents. Immigrant artists who value Halifax's supportive and inclusive artistic community suggest that the city offers a welcoming environment for some newcomer artists. The above quotations are testaments to the positive integration experiences that some immigrant artists have had with their artist peer groups in Halifax. For these immigrant artists Halifax has provided a relatively easy entry point into a Canadian art world.

Many participants indicated that they consider Halifax's open and supportive artistic communities to offer them professional advantages. According to musicians and visual artists, a strong sense of community binds the supportive environment. This view suggests that artistic workers benefit from and are attracted to social capital, an asset that Halifax is apparently not only capable of but perhaps exceptional at providing them because of the social dynamics of its artistic networks. Halifax appears to offer an environment where immigrant artists can build social capital because of its relatively open and remarkably strong artistic communities.

Halifax's artist member organizations were mentioned as instrumental facilitators of developing inclusive supportive communities. The importance that some immigrant artists attributed to the supportive community suggests that some artists seek out traditional community values of support and inclusivity in the places they choose to call home.

Visual artists and musicians were most likely to describe welcoming and supportive art communities. Several musicians and visual artists found remarkable levels of support from their professional peers. One artist spoke about how considerate the artist community was:

"Yes, I think it's really the fact that artists that meet, they support each other. It's a real good support system that is here through VANS – Visual Arts Nova Scotia – but also Nova Scotia Design and Crafts Council. And it's just amazing how they really want to make it work for everybody. It's not there are the top good ones and now nobody else gets a spot anymore. It's really okay, let's check it out. How can we make it work that everybody can be included? And I really love that, that supporting feel."

Halifax's artist organizations nurture supportive communities and inclusive environments.

When asked about the level of support from the artistic community a musician spoke highly of the professional peer group:

BB: What areas have you received support from as far as the artistic community goes?

Musician: "Definitely the musicians that I've played with. You know, contact musicians who either play with me or be part of the show or to get help... The musicians here have definitely been really, really amazing from the very beginning, both as people, as musicians, and as friends too I guess, or just at least colleagues, sort of giving you that assistance you need. Treating you as though you are part of the community. So I think that to me is pretty much the one, is the actual artists themselves have been the most supportive and really the ones that have sort of helped me get to where I am at the moment."

Musicians in Halifax see themselves as part of a community, one that accepts and supports newcomers. The respondent also indicates that the community is valued for its social contribution to his life in addition to professional benefits. The musician's attribution of personal success to the community of artists indicates that Halifax provides a nurturing social environment for incoming musicians.

The following comment from a visual artist echoes sentiments about the career assets of Halifax's supportive arts community.

"Like there's a close knit art community so you can kind of be supported and bolstered. It's relatively non-competitive in a way that other arts communities can be much more so. Like I mean I think all arts communities, because there's not much available, tend to be a competitive kind of arena. But I think Halifax has a softness about it or a community spirit about it that I think people find attractive."

This visual artist went on to claim that alongside quality of life, the character of the local artist community is one of the main reasons that artists stay in Halifax. The respondent suggests that although Halifax is not immune to competition in art communities the environment is friendlier than most.

Another visual artist expressed similar views; however, this time inclusivity rather than competition was the focus of the discourse:

BB: What about in the art community, how helpful have the people in that community been for you as you have been advancing your career here?

"Again, very welcome. But I think that the art world is... The definition of art world, it's something small and close. But comparable to the other countries, here it is more welcoming. It's still close but it's more welcome than you know in the other countries."

(Artist)

Although many of the respondents' experiences of integration and professional networking were uncomplicated or remarkably positive, others described encountering social barriers and integration challenges. According to some immigrant cultural sector workers, prejudice, nepotism, social distance, and exclusive behavior exist within Halifax's community and can affect the working environment. These behaviors limit the ability of some immigrant artistic workers to profit from Halifax's reputation for providing accessible social capital. As mentioned, the social barriers immigrant artists encountered manifest in several forms and affected the respondents in different ways. Experiences with exclusion vary in relation to the people involved and the motivation for the behaviour.

Some integration challenges were related to being new in town, and were considered surmountable with time and effort. Several respondents mentioned that although Haligonians are friendly people they tend to maintain social distance that takes time to close.

BB: To what extent did the people of Halifax provide a welcoming community for you?

Visual Artist: I found it a little bit of both. I found that there were plenty of people who are very polite and very seemingly happy to spend and meet with you, and generous in their time doing that. But at the same time, it's a city that seems to like require people to be here for a while before you get any sense of closeness. It seems to sort of... I guess because of its size maybe, the people are not so eager to rush into friendships because you know... And I guess I've kind of come to understand that a little bit as I've been here.

The artist suggests that the smaller size of the community prevents people from rushing into relationships: "you are going to see that person a couple of times a week so I think people are a little bit reserved at first until they get a sense of who you are and where you are coming from...". This artist described a similar experience in the professional community:

"But there are opportunities. You have to make them, and you definitely have to persist. But it seems that, once again, like once you persist and keep kind of trying then doors start to open up. And I think that is one of the things about this place, is that doors don't necessarily open up immediately but they tend to if you kind of stick around..."(Visual artist)

Not all integration challenges were of such a temporary nature. Two respondents believed that they had experienced substantial social barriers because the local community saw them as outsiders:

There are a lot of limitations, man. You know, do I feel 100% that I could come in anywhere that I could come in the doors? No. And I do find a little barrier. You know? You're not from here. This city is not very mixed in terms of multicultural roots. (Dancer)

The dancer who made this comment had spoken appreciatively about Canadians and Haligonians treatment of newcomers, but encountered challenges in the professional community. This experience suggests that people who are not identified as belonging to the local community may feel left out. The dancer's comment implies that belonging is a matter of racial or cultural similarity, while the statement about being "from here" suggests a local bias. In equating the identity markers, the artist implies that being from here means a particular ethnic background.

The experience of feeling isolated because of otherness was not unique: *So I started to make a network. But still, my last name is [name]. And when they look at me, I am the one only with them. I say there's no Chinese here. There's no African here. Where is everyone? ... Nobody. I cannot meet anyone. I say, okay, let's just start with the new technology. Let's use Kijiji, use the Facebook. I am an artist, I am [name]. I came 8 years ago or 6 years ago or whatever it was. I need to meet artists just for talking, topic whatever, schedule, and be friendly and find some cafe or studio. Or you come in my apartment. None respond. Kijiji, if I will post something in dating, they will like [snaps fingers] like this. Where is the artist?...*

... So far, I am like with the Visual Arts I'm a member, I just get it like 3 weeks ago. And I come by it with my friend. I forget, there is a gallery in [inaudible] . Anyway, I am a member now. And there is one Khyber on Barrington Street. And I'm like 4 or 6 member with Contemporary Art Group. And I went to the meeting. This is good. I found everyone is like... Everybody... I am the youngest one there in the group. And they call it Contemporary Art. So I saw so many landscape and water colour just like flower. I say this is Contemporary. Where is the abstract? So I feel like I didn't fit with them. They are nice people. They welcome me. So I went to just one meeting and that's it.

The artist has been unable to network successfully in Halifax despite deliberate efforts to meet people. The respondent suggests that being a minority in a homogenous population has not helped make relationships. The respondent also describes failed approaches to networking; online social media was unsuccessful as had been efforts to network through artist member organizations, although the latter was a matter of not meeting the right people rather than simply not meeting people. The comparison that the respondent makes between social networking and professional networking suggests that professional communities are more exclusive.

Although most of the respondents said that Halifax's community is friendly, some believed discrimination, racism and protectionism are hidden below the surface and appear in the workplace.

...sometimes you feel you don't fit in very easy. My degree doesn't qualify. And I say I am an artist. I can qualify by a brush, by colour. This is the language I talk. It is the creative way. There is no qualify. I have diploma of art. Whatever, it doesn't mean nothing. You just give me the canvas and I will prove. So people were welcoming. They

helped me to just like give me hope. But maybe later, I know this is not all. You need to be find job, find the stuff. I found like people who are not white maybe. If I go to Toronto, I would see so many that look like my face around every... Like I would find them in the gallery, I would find them in the shop, I will find them like working everywhere, even in the airport. But when I came to Halifax, I didn't see this environment like get together. I don't know, I feel we are still behind. It is still behind. I'm not sure why. And people are good, friendly here. But when you get challenged to find a job here, I found they don't choose us when there's competition... (Visual Artist)

This visual artist catalogues challenges that face immigrants hiding in the job market including racism and protectionism. The respondent implies that without an ethnically diverse population in Halifax the effects of workplace discrimination are amplified and harder to avoid. The artist also mentioned being unable to get recognition for diplomas earned abroad.

Some respondents distinguished between an inclusive community of artistic peers and prejudice on the side of employers. One visual artist suggested that artists help and include each other in Halifax, but employers prefer to hire local people when they can:

"No, the arts community here is so open and welcoming to immigrants, to anybody. I'm not only talking about immigrants, I also think of people that move from other places here. It's just like, "Oh, you're new. You should come there and you should go there. And come be a part of us." It's really all really trying to integrate everybody that is here. And I've never had the feeling that there was kind of a "Oh, she's from away," kind of feel. Or they just think it, but I never felt that way. Where if you go and want to have a job, they might think we want to give it somebody that is from here and not to somebody that is from away. That is what I experienced." (Visual Artist)

Some of the respondents suggested or implied that discriminatory behaviour stems from racism, nepotism and protectionism or some combination of the above. One respondent described how protective attitudes exacerbate prejudices:

"You know, I think there is still, ... scratch the surface, you'll still find racism and prejudice. And it's very civil. It's not obvious but boy, it's there. It's definitely there. And I think that kind of mitigates against any immigrant who is not... Well, any immigrant at all. I mean because I am American, I don't... And I spent a lot of time in Canada. I don't sense it as much. But I think other immigrants definitely do. And so you combine that with what I think is an ongoing lack of opportunity in the arts. Like I say, if you have a job in the arts, you tend to be very protective of it. So if somebody comes from outside and starts to try and do stuff... If the pie is only this big, if it's a zero sum game, and somebody else is going to come and take a piece of your pie away, you tend to react defensively. And I think it is the kind of culture of poverty that we have here where the resources are limited. And anybody who is coming in to try and get a piece of it is a threat. And I think there are elements of that as well." (Visual Artist)

Nepotism and ethnocentrism were also mentioned as potential barriers facing newcomers in Halifax's art community:

" I think that on the ground level, people are very welcoming. I think as you move up in the levels of business or government, I think it is worse than say Ontario or Quebec or Montreal for sure. The multiculturalism in terms of like the job sector and all that and in sort of the system is a little more backwards. It's a couple of decades behind, I think. But on the ground level, like the people and in terms of like just the social aspect, it's almost...it's better. It's almost ahead of central Canada because it's got a really warm... Like there is a party atmosphere here almost, and everyone is welcoming that way. But then as soon as you start getting down to business, it's like okay, well, we do this and then you guys can wait, or whatever. I've experienced that. A lot of people that I know from other cultures have experienced that too just in the system itself. But I think there's a lot of organizations and people who are trying to change that." (Visual Artist)

The above comment distinguishes between congeniality and professional relations and mentions that markers of difference can be held against people when the time comes for "getting down to business". Although the quote identifies lingering challenges to interethnic, international, and interracial equity, the musician believes that efforts to make positive changes are being promoted. Notably, the musician seems to express faith in the abilities of local organizations that are fighting for immigrant rights to help effect change.

Several respondents including visual artist, musicians and dancers had experienced some form of territorialism that had occurred because an established artist felt threatened by new competition.

BB: How supportive has the local arts community been for someone coming from another country and starting a career?

Musician: It's funny, some people have been really helpful and others, it's kind of like beating your head against a brick wall. And I mean it's not a negative thing. Like I said, it's that whole having to start again. Like these people... You know, I kind of just blew in, I kind of just turned up out of nowhere. And people sometimes are taken aback by that. Be it because it's a threat to what they do, the work that they might be getting or not getting or they just don't like sort of new people coming. And all these people that have been here for ages are still trying to do the same things. I think in general, it has been quite positive in that people have been generally helpful. And other times... It's never that anyone has been not helpful or rude but you just get that feeling that they don't really want to help you get ahead because you might kind of tread in their territory.

The respondent perceived some people as protecting the status quo in an arts community that has some long established members. The next comment comes from a dancer discussing a similar situation.

"I mean there are people who have been doing their job in the dance community for, I don't know, 10 years or 15 years or 20 years. And then this [new] person comes, and imagine they have great skills and a very good curriculum from having been doing things internationally. And they don't hire this person because it's threatening." (Dancer)

The interviews suggest that in the experience of study participants many of the social tensions existing within the Halifax community are provoked by a belief that the pool of resources in the city's cultural sector is limited. Discourse about this subject suggests that people with coveted positions or established

careers may react defensively to newcomers whom they believe threaten their security. The mentality of a 'zero sum gain' held by the community was discussed as an underlying barrier facing newcomers regardless of origin or profession. Participants indicated that the mindset could exacerbate other social tensions and encourage nepotism. Several respondents believed that the industry was saturated in terms of the number of artists it could sustain. Discussions suggest that some industry members believe that the economics of the cultural sector in Halifax are dictated by a limited amount of demand for cultural products.

Section 2: Advantages and Disadvantages of Working as an Immigrant Artist in a Mid-Sized City

The size of the city and related characteristics of its population emerged as one of the most prominent factors affecting the cultural industries in Halifax. These conditions appear to influence the behaviour of industry members towards newcomers. Discourse about city size indicates that respondents feel that local demographics and economics affected industry dynamics and career potential. Artists said that networking opportunities, the nature of artistic work that can be practiced in a market, and the economic viability of being an artist in the city were affected by the size of the market.

Working as an artist in a mid-sized city was generally considered to offer advantages and disadvantages. The nature of the constraints and opportunities suggest that working in a mid-sized centre results in trade-offs. Artists sacrifice some of the opportunities that are available in larger centres, but they gain different advantages and are liberated from some of the challenges of working in a large market.

The following table summarizes the relative advantages and disadvantages of working in a mid-sized city instead of a large urban centre. These are the explained in the context of the participants' comments.

Advantages	Disadvantages
Fewer peers to compete with	Competing for fewer resources
Easier to meet people in the industry	Fewer people to work with
Unexplored opportunities	Few opportunities for diverse and creative expression
More affordable living	Less commercial opportunity

Although Halifax cannot compare with large urban centres in terms of absolute networking opportunities, respondents suggest that bigger may not always be better.

I think the biggest opportunity it provides is that it is a small community. So you get to know people. You can meet people quite quickly. And people are generally open to kind of new filmmakers or new artists in the beginning. So I think that is definitely the biggest asset, just access to people with connections. (Visual artist)

This comment introduces the concept of accessibility. This is the most commonly stated career advantage that Halifax provides immigrant artists. Different types of accessibility will be introduced throughout this section. As indicated by the previous comment some of the participants believed that the city size gives them better opportunities for working with other industry members. The small size of the community creates better conditions for networking, and encourages openness of the industry to new people.

Although larger urban centres like New York were often seen as places with greater opportunities for artists, the opinion that they had become inaccessible was common. Urban centres were seen as unaffordable and less friendly places where nobody has the time or interest to get to know each other. In comparison Halifax offered the artists greater opportunities for networking and affordability that favored new artists.

"I mean those things don't happen in Manhattan. He couldn't afford an apartment like he's got in Manhattan. And if he ever met his landlord, he sure as hell wouldn't serve as president of his board of anything. And Halifax is small enough that these connections can happen. You can be very productive. You can meet people all across all sectors. Everything is so accessible right now. And I think these are all huge gifts that Haligonians I think need to recognize and need to take advantage of." (Musician)

This musician believed that Halifax was in an advantageous position to support new artist and to grow the cultural industries while larger centres had reached a plateau. The respondent recognized huge potential in Halifax's relative capacity for progress and saw this as a motivation for living in the area. Although potential for growth in the cultural industries does not favour most immigrants over other Haligonians or Canadian citizens, the opportunities they imply have some attractions for foreigners.

The size of the city has facilitated the development of its supportive arts community, a quality respondents thought would be hard to find in bigger centres. *"Mostly the number of artists and the support from the non-artists...I don't think you'd find it much in a big city. I think the size of the city helps in Halifax (Visual Artist)."* Without specific reference to size the following statement makes a parallel comparison:

"So I felt really welcomed. He offered me an opportunity. And that was quick. He was very kind. He gave advice. Even though I wasn't a production craft person, still that was very nice. And that is somebody in the government. I would never get that sort of thing in New York." (Visual artist)

The respondents suggest that the relative accessibility of the cultural industries in Halifax provides advantages for incoming artists. Specifically there

appears to be a closer relationship between people in administrative positions to those working in the industry. However, this professional dynamic appears to rely on a level of intimacy that could pose problems for individuals who are not easily able to access social spheres. Some of the artists claim that 'who you know' is instrumental to a successful career in Halifax and that relationships may be more important in the city than elsewhere.

"Because NS is kind of tight-knit, if you didn't notice. So like I told you, it's like a club. And your role is to cut into that club. And I think you have to really... Because if you didn't grow up here, they won't remember you when you were small. So you have to kind of remind them about who you are. And really just building a rapport with people."

The dancer implies that the cultural industries in Halifax operate under highly personal conditions. Not only are personal connections important to cultural sector careers in Halifax, the comment suggests that newcomers are responsible for breaking in to networks. Regardless of how open people are to newcomers, industry dynamics based on personal relationships imply that people adjusting to a new culture, people learning a new language, and those who lack pre-existing social connections may be at a professional disadvantage.

The level of diversity in mid-sized city was considered to create several challenges and opportunities for Halifax. Respondents had different opinions about the amount of diversity in the cultural industries. Although some saw Halifax as diverse and cosmopolitan, others viewed both the city and its cultural industries as relatively homogenous in products and members. The limitations of the study method make it impossible to quantify the amount of diversity in Halifax's cultural industries. The different opinions of respondents also make it difficult to theorize about whether the city is culturally diverse or homogenous. It is also clear that opinions about a subjective concept like cosmopolitanism are relative. Nonetheless, several study participants believed that Halifax is less cosmopolitan and culturally diverse than some larger cities. Several participants expressed opinions that a relative lack of variety in the Halifax's cultural industries had both positive and negative effects on their career opportunities.

A subject that came up as both a constraint and an opportunity was the reality of creating art in Halifax that is influenced by foreign cultural traditions or social realities that are not part of mainstream culture. In other words, being different can be both good and bad; it allows people to stand out and reduces competition, but it can make harder for them to communicate their messages and to receive support. Review of respondents' comments suggests that in some cases these effects were amplified because the city was not considered to be as diverse as larger urban centres, in other cases issues were of a national scale.

Some respondents said that art, as a form of communication, is not always universally comprehensible:

"in terms of what your art practice is, that would be different because it's definitely very obvious that a certain visual alphabet that you might have developed in the different country is not...it's a foreign language here. Art is a visual language, right? And as much

as we'd like to think that images are universal, they are not. And you come with a different image vocabulary that sometimes is not perceived as art even. And that is a very interesting piece. Well, somewhat I have encountered that. Although when I had the opportunity to exhibit my work, I have encountered great press response and very positive reviews of my work. And I even have sold my work to collectors. Institutionally though, and this is a bigger piece actually, my work has not found a venue, an avenue to become part of the Canadian art world.” (Visual Artist)

Canada was perceived as having acquired an official artistic vocabulary with regional significance. Institutions were posited as the mechanism for maintaining and codifying the language.

“And there is this sort of prejudice too against certain kinds of work. You know, there's a certain painting that is done in the Caribbean that some people find just doesn't look like a contemporary painting that people think would be attractive in this context. I personally don't feel that way but I know even some of my colleagues who have expressed concern that this work doesn't look contemporary enough or it doesn't look a modernist painting, or this looks a bit folk-ish. They won't say this is... And those are a kind of racist agenda to that kind of comment which is not... It's not good because they are so determined to promote what they believe is culturally interesting work in this context, that has North American culture written all over it. But they will find African work or Caribbean work or South American work or Mexican work to be a little bit...so different that perhaps it wouldn't receive the same kind of open respect or would not stimulate the same kind of comments as work that is produced here.”(Visual Artist)

This artist supported the notion that artistic languages are not universal. A North American discourse in Canada's art world may exclude other cultures. The previous two quotes spoke of challenges that probably affect all of Canada and the United States. Other issues raised were more regionally specific, relating to the diversity of the local dominant culture. Respondents mentioned facing several challenges because their artistic genre did not have a large or knowledgeable audience in Halifax.

One respondent spoke of challenges encountered introducing a new dance genre to Halifax *“You know what? Really, I had to create a need...I had to create a need. So what commercial opportunities? I had to create them myself.” (Dancer)* Although this respondent was ultimately successful, bringing something new to Halifax was initially an individual effort. The remark introduces the idea that some artists are likely to receive less support early on from established institutions and venues because they do not fit into the standard programming vocabulary. Another dancer elaborated on the sentiment:

“Well, when you think of my particular case, it's very important that you consider the global picture. So theatres or venues will primarily program whatever people like most. So if you have a theatre in Cape Breton, you are going to do a lot of fiddling and Celtic dancing or singer songwriters or whatever people like a lot. And then you are going to try... So there is like a recipe for the theatres. And mainly it's music – musical arts that people can relate to naturally.”(Dancer)

Dancers observed that performing and marketing dances that were not part of mainstream local culture affected their artistic development. Two different reasons were expressed, which are explained in the following two

comments. The first describes how established ideas about a well recognized foreign artistic tradition can curb its development:

"I think that what I find difficult artistically is that something culturally diverse is seen as something that it's like very folklorical, static. Like for instance the Multicultural Festival that is coming up on Friday. It's like doing the folk dance but it's not really living art because it's supposed to be like this thing from the past." (Dancer)

This next remark speaks of how the energy put into educating the public about a foreign artistic tradition gets in the way of an artist's personal growth.

"The thing is you are fighting so hard to get people to understand what it is that you do, that you don't develop your self. Like you should be at a certain point by this stage in terms of your art. You know, you should be learning more. You should get more workshops. You're doing your master's, and your master's teachers. You should be going home. But you are so involved in teaching others and giving that you don't give to yourself." (Dancer)

Some respondents spoke of the strong representation of Celtic and singer songwriter genres in the music industry. While some remarks extolled the importance of these genres to the identity of the region, others described the difficulty of competing against the hometown sound. Some were leery of homogenizing effects within the music scene.

"So yes, there are always people trying to develop new things, I guess. I don't know, for me, I think it gives me a kind of identity. Halifax sort of fits in with all the other little bits of my identity and puts it all together into a cohesive picture for me. You know, because I teach about Celtic music, and people here take that seriously enough that it is actually taught." (Musician)

In the above comment a musician talks about how valuable the Celtic aspect of the Maritimes' musical identity is to personal identity. Although the musician quoted in the following passage valued the contribution of Celtic and singer songwriter genre to the region's identity he also described some of the challenges that it could present to newcomer artists.

... Culturally it is sold very singer songwriter. I know people in the rest of Canada have looked... Musicians watch the ECMAs just to see how many fiddles they can count. And I laugh. I go, "Come on, guys, like don't be so harsh, It's Nova Scotia." But it is sold like... So someone outside that clique or someone from away might come here and go, "wow, I have no chance here. Like how I am supposed to play my kalimba and make a go of it when it's all...everyone seems to be playing guitars and mandolins and violins?" (Musician)

Some of the respondents felt that a lack of diversity and wealth in the local community inhibited certain types of artistic expression and made finding collaborators on projects covering non-mainstream themes challenging. In comparison, large cities with more immigrant residents and generally more diverse populations and greater disposable income were seen to offer better environments for cultivating variety and innovation in the cultural industries.

In terms of finding people to work with, it's definitely harder here. In places like Montreal and Toronto and Vancouver, I would be able to find more versions say of myself in different fields. So it's been more difficult here because of that. But at the same time, it allows for... Well, when you do kind of find somebody that you can work with, it's very clear that you can work with them. (Visual Artist)

Although a relatively homogeneous and small population was not seen as conducive to artistic expression and innovation some artists believed that it created potential opportunities for new artists because there are fewer peers to compete with. Participants indicated that arriving from some places that are commonly associated with as hearths of culture could also give artists allure and credibility in Halifax. In contrast larger markets were considered to provide better opportunities for innovation and more diversity, but suffered from intense competition and relative anonymity.

Several respondents claimed that the homogeneity in the industry's reduced competition for people that bring new and different ideas.

"Q: What are some of the limitations of pursuing a career in music in this area?"

A: It's the culture on the island, because it's Celtic. It's violin. It's fiddle. It's very British background. And there are a lot of those. Not that there's anything wrong with that. But, you know. That because of that background, that pushes other things in the back a little bit. But at the same time it should help because there aren't so many Latin groups for example. It should help..." (Musician)

"... Impossible. It's a huge city... It would have been impossible for me to go, "Yeah, I want to organize something." So it's very neat. I find it's like you can model a little bit the city. I find you can do so much with it. It's so young. I mean you can do so much with Halifax." (Dancer)

This dancer suggested that Halifax is much more malleable and available than larger cities, a condition that suggests a certain amount of opportunity for creative and diverse artists coming to Halifax.

Other respondents appreciated the fact that although the city did not have a great richness and diversity of cultural offerings Halifax provided the opportunity for them to stand out.

"What would have made me move away was better opportunities and better salaries. And to some extent, a more diverse community and more cultural resources. There is a lot of cultural stuff that we don't get here. A lot of that. I was just looking at some of the names that are coming to the Montreal Jazz Festival. We don't get them here. Or when I go to NY or Toronto or Montreal, I always try to catch something that there is no way I'm going to see here. But then it costs a lot more to live in those places. You are a much smaller fish in a much bigger pond. Here I can be a relatively larger fish in a smaller pond, which suits my ego..." (Visual Artist)

In comparison with the previous observation the following comment by a musician provides a harsh contrast between the potential to be somebody in Halifax and the likelihood of being nobody in a larger city.

I have friends of friends, like associates, "Oh, I played in New York." Do you know how easy it is to play in New York? Like you go there because in New York, you don't get paid to play in a lot of clubs. You have to actually literally hand a tin jar around at the end of your performance. (Musician)

These arguments and remarks beg comparison with other opinions about accessibility in Halifax. They suggest that Halifax can be an enabling place to work for artists because it has unexploited potential.

Although many positive remarks about the city's comparative advantages are encouraging, much of the potential respondents saw in Halifax is still unrealized. For example, several participants voiced concerns about attitudes in Halifax that prevent change and protect the status quo.

"...I think the challenges would be much more in the area of having a particular... I don't really like to use the world vision because it's kind of overstating the case but at least an idea and a notion of where I'd like these programs to go. And then trying to express that to some people for whom the status quo was adequate or sufficient or okay. So there's been a little bit of cajoling, a little bit of pulling along. And I suppose a part of that is this whole thing that people talk about, the sort of Halifax meekness or whatever. You know, where we are a small city, we think small, etc., etc. And I don't see that at all for Halifax. I think the potential in Halifax, which has been realized in many areas, but I think the potential is enormous. I think it is an extremely desirable place to live. I think it has huge potential appeal to a lot of creative people. I think one thing that is holding us back is a mindset that says... People have asked me hundreds of times, why on earth would you move to Halifax? So sort of low self esteem on the part of a city that I think has no reason to feel that way. Do you know what I mean?"(Musician)

Although Halifax is more than capable of growing the cultural industries some people are not ready or willing to take steps to bring it about.

"So I guess it's a matter of money. I wish I knew because this has such potential. The first thing that I thought is I can't believe this place. It's got such potential. But maybe they just want to keep it a quiet city. Maybe they just want to keep it a low key city. Which is fine because that might be too... I mean why would you want to become a really... You know. I don't know what they are thinking."(Dancer)

Although not all of the respondents indicated why they believed the city was slow to change the following remark makes a suggestion:

"NY is a place where it is so used to people coming from elsewhere. It's so used to people being there for a while or for like a couple of weeks. It's just one of those places. Like people come, people go, people do their thing, they don't do their thing. You know, whatever. It's very elastic in some ways. Whereas I think Halifax is a lot less elastic. I think you kind of almost have to make yourself part of Halifax rather than the other way around somehow. So maybe there is a little of that. It's a smaller place, and smaller places tend to just be used to things the way they are used to things, and be a little slower to take change on somewhat." (Visual Artist)

The various experiences and opinions of the study participants suggest that there are likely several reasons that the city may give the impression of being reluctant to grow or to change. Many of them appear related to economic constraints and the small size of the population. A history of slow growth and low immigration may not prepare a place well for change. This does not suggest that the city cannot change and that it cannot develop its cultural sector. Nor does it mean that Halifax is a particularly bad place for immigrant artists, although the experiences of study participants do appear to indicate some barriers that make it challenging for immigrant artists to succeed in the city.

Although Halifax appears to be a good example to illustrate the costs and benefits of working as a new artist in a mid-sized city, most of the respondents

did **not** make decisions to come here based primarily on an evaluation of career based costs and benefits. It is reasonable to assume, however, that such factors may influence a person's decision to stay in Halifax once they arrive.

Section 3: Different Experiences: Dancers, Musicians and Visual Artists

Among the different professional categories, musicians spoke most frequently about career opportunities and potential, indicating a remarkable talent pool in the jazz and independent genres and a large number of live venues. Visual artists on the other hand were most likely to be critical of the quality of local talent, local support, and a low supply of exhibition space and studio space; however, certain visual artists spoke more passionately about the support they received from their peers than the other respondents. Dancers did not mention having the same type of peer support as the other two categories. The different experiences of the various categories may reflect the size of the industries. In Halifax the music industry supported by far the largest population in 2001, visual arts second, and dance a distant third. It seems reasonable to assume that musicians have more opportunity than the others.

Interpretation

Before interpreting the finding I would like to include a brief discussion about how some of the interpretations and information already presented should be considered. Any comments presented about the attitudes of Halifaxians towards immigrant artists are not intended to be a general characterization of the city or its people. Rather, they are simply representations of the experiences of study participants.

Respondents' comments indicate that Halifax does not provide them with immediate opportunities. As one musician put it, the city had not reached the "critical mass" necessary to provide opportunities for a large number of artists. In general the artists' comparisons of Halifax's cultural industries with those of larger centres supported the findings of scholarly research that suggest that

larger centres with concentrations of cultural industries provide optimal conditions for doing cultural sector work. However, the respondents' experiences and opinions did not indicate that they believed these ideal industry conditions in bigger centres always translated into opportunities for artists.

Although respondents did not indicate that Halifax's cultural industries create opportunities, what it does appear to offer is a relatively attractive environment for artists to create their own opportunities. Some respondents felt that Halifax was a saturated market in terms of the ratio of artists to patrons, but there was some indication that participants believed that some artists could take advantage of the fact that the market had not fully matured. This suggests that although working as an artist in Halifax appears to come at the expense of access to existing opportunities in large cultural centres, for some artists it may be easier to create opportunities than to compete for them.

This is not to say that the experience of the participants has indicated that creating opportunities is an easy task. The approach to being successful in these conditions appears to require entrepreneurialism. While artists working in larger centres may not be liberated from the task of creating their own opportunities, it is likely that they have access to supporting institutions that do some of the entrepreneurial legwork. These findings are consistent with those presented in Bennet's study of artist outmigration from a small city in Australia (Bennet 2010).

If an artist is willing to attempt a career in the city without the critical mass of personnel, participants have indicated that Halifax has certain career advantages in terms of affordability and opportunities for encounters with cultural industry members. Many artists in Halifax appear to have access to each other as well as members of cultural sector institutions and government. It also seems that relatively strong artistic communities can provide "bolstering" support for artists through social capital. The findings regarding the benefits of social dynamics are consistent with earlier work done in Halifax that investigating the experience of musicians and other creative professionals (Grant and Kronstal 2010, Grant, Haggett and Morton 2009)

The findings suggest that developing social capital in Halifax is valued and important for career success, both in terms of gaining the benefits of peer support and access to professional opportunities. Respondents' discussions of the value of social capital to artistic careers combined with their descriptions of diversity in the city and integration experiences have several implications. They appear to support Putnam's suggestion that homogenous populations are better suited for the formation of social capital (Putnam 2007; Grant and Kronstal 2010). Artists' appreciation of Halifax's strong social capital does not support Florida's suggestion that creative workers are repelled by strong communities and prefer looser associations with a rich diversity of people (Florida 2002). Nor do these findings suggest that tolerance is universally important among creative professionals. Although the respondents likely find diverse and tolerant populations attractive, becoming a member of a community regardless of the

diversity of its population appears acceptable. It is possible that artists welcome the security provided by social capital because of the precarious nature of artistic work. Findings are consistent with theories suggesting that social capital can act as an economically significant substitute for support provided by more formal institutions (Hoyman, Faricy 2009).

While some immigrant artists appear to benefit from the intimacy of Halifax's professional networks, characterizations of the city's social and professional dynamics do not always appear to favour newcomers. Not all study participants appeared to have access to social networks within their industries and others felt that forming connections was a slow process has implications for the nature of social capital in the city. Respondents indicated that 'Otherness' or difference might have made it more difficult for them to form some relationships.

It could be significant that all of the participants who mentioned feeling somehow 'different' yet had access to informal professional networks had connections to some form of social capital building facilitator, such as a relationship with a more established Halifax resident, immigrating very early in life, attending one of the city's universities, or a work placement program established through cooperation between immigrant settlement services and a cultural sector institution. Links to one of these network facilitators did not seem as important for immigrant artists who came from cultural contexts that they considered relatively similar to those in Canada.

Although most participants felt positively about the welcome they received in Halifax, descriptions of territoriality, nepotism and racism along with attitudes that maintain the status quo suggest social influences inhibit change and the influx of new people. In addition to these concerns, the personal nature of doing business in the industry may put some immigrants that do not have connections at a disadvantage. In general the experience of the study participants suggest that due to the various integration challenges it is more difficult for immigrant artists to access opportunities than native artists. Discourses about participants' experiences do not give reason to believe that Halifax is a more exclusive place than anywhere else; however, they indicate that the city does not provide an ideal integration environment for everybody.

Several of the experiences and opinions of the study participants support the premise that immigrant artists can help develop the cultural industries through diversification. Concerns about the negative effects of low turnover upon development in the cultural sector suggest that new people with new ideas contribute to innovation. Some of the study participants had been able to come into the city and effect change. These findings support theories suggesting that diverse and dynamic populations enhance innovation.

Conclusions

Comparing the advantages and constraints of working as an artist in Halifax raised by study participants leads to several conclusions in terms of what the city offers immigrant artists. Discourses about the limited amount of diversity in the city's cultural industries and the market constraints associated with city size seem to be balanced by advantages that do not necessarily imply substantial economic opportunities for the artists and are related rather to the ease of working with the artistic community. These conditions appear to favour artists in the early stages of their career and imply that it may be challenging for Halifax to attract or retain the more successful immigrant artists through the virtues of its cultural industries. It is not appropriate, however, to assume that new artists will find it easy to support themselves through art in Halifax.

Another issue that appears is that the qualities that Halifax provides some artists in terms of networking opportunities and social dynamics are likely not visible outside of the city. Therefore some of the industries' advantages are not likely to help Halifax attract immigrant artists. A final issue is related to some of the respondents' indications that the city is not as culturally diverse as some other places. It may be more difficult for some immigrant artists to find a market for their work in this environment than in some of Canada's largest urban centres that receive much more immigration of all kinds.

This study has implications for cultural development policy for HRM regarding the diversification of the cultural sector. Findings suggest that the city's cultural sector can benefit from immigrant artists; their presence in the cultural industry helps to create new growth and possibilities. Therefore the diversification strategy in itself appears to be sound. But immigrant artists do not always benefit from coming to the city. It is not easy to be the agent of change; the fact that artistic work is neither secure nor well compensated complicates the challenge. Immigration and cultural policy must take this into account. Attracting immigrant artists to the city in order to achieve the city's objectives should not be done based on the belief that artists will create their own opportunities. If artists are intentionally attracted to the city they need programs that connect them to opportunities both to form relationships and to access employment. Without such policies and programs in place newcomers lack any level of career security in the arts.

These implications suggest broader issues for place based economic development strategies. Despite the fact that creative workers may bring innovation and benefits to a city, development policies that expect creative workers to create their own jobs puts an overwhelming and unreasonable burden upon their shoulders. When the strategy for engendering urban growth is to recruit immigrants or migrants then local government must accept some responsibility to facilitate social and economic integration. The case for this argument is particularly strong regarding artistic work.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported with a grant from the Atlantic Metropolis Centre. The author is grateful for the assistance and cooperation of the many participants in the work, and to Mary Ann Martel for transcriptions. Thanks to Dr Patricia Manuel and Dr Jill Grant for feedback on earlier drafts.

References

Bennet, D. (2010). Creative Migration: a Western Australian case study of creative artists, *Australian Geographer*, 41 (1), 117-128.

Bowels, S., & Herbert, G. (2002). Social Capital and Community Governance. *The Economic Journal*, 112 (483), F419-F436.

Currid, E., Williams, S. (2010). Two Cities Five Industries: Similarities and Differences within and between Cultural Industries in New York and Los Angeles. *Journal of Planning and Education Research*. 29(3) pp 322-335

Currid, E., Connolly, J. (2008). The Geography of Advanced Services and The Case of Art and Culture". *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*. 98(2) pp. 414-434.

Dunn, K. (2000). Chapter 6 In "Qualitative Research Methods in Human Geography". Ed. Ian Hay. Oxford University Press: Victoria, Melbourne.

Florida, R. (2002). *The Rise of the Creative Class and How it's transforming work, leisure, community and everyday life*. Basic Books: New York.

Florida, R. (2005). *Cities and The Creative Class*. Routledge: New York, NY.

Gertler, M., & Vinodrai, T. (2004). *Competing on Creativity: Focus on Halifax* A report prepared for the Greater Halifax Partnership.
(Available at: http://http://www.greaterhalifax.com/site-ghp2/media/Parent/Competing_on_Creativity_Focus_on_Halifax.pdf)

Gibson, C., Luckman, S., and Willoughby-Smith, J. (2010). Creativity without Borders? Rethinking remoteness and proximity. *Australian Geographer*, 41 (1), 25-38.

Grant, J., Kronstal, K. (2010). The Social Dynamics of Attracting Talent in Halifax. *The Canadian Geographer*. 54(3) pp. 347-365

Grant, J. L., Haggett, J., and Morton, J. (2009). *The Halifax Sound: Live Music and the Economic Development of Halifax* (Available at: http://suburbs.planning.dal.ca/related_ISRN.html)

- Greater Halifax Partnership (GHP) (2005). Halifax Region Immigration Strategy: Business Case and Strategic Action Plan. (Available at: http://www.greaterhalifax.com/site-ghp2/media/Parent/HRIS_ActionPlan.pdf)
- Halifax Regional Municipality (HRM) (2005). Strategies for Success: Halifax Regional Municipality's Economic Development Strategy 2005-2010. (Available at: www.halifax.ca/economicstrategy/documents/EconomicStrategies.pdf)
- Halifax Regional Municipality (HRM) (2006). HRM Cultural Plan (Available at: www.halifax.ca/culturalplan/index.html)
- Hill Strategies Inc. (2005). Diversity in Canada's Arts Labour Force. Statistical Insights on the Arts, Vol. 3 No. 3 (Available at: <http://www.hillstrategies.com/>)
- Hill Strategies Inc. (2006) Artists in Large Cities . Statistical Insights on the Arts, Vol. 4 No. 4. (Available at: <http://www.hillstrategies.com/>)
- Hoyman, M., & Faricy, C. (2009). It takes a Villages: A Test of Creative Class, Social Capital, and Human Capital Theories. *Urban Affairs Review*, 44 (3), 311-333.
- Leslie, D. (2006). Cultural Industries and the Production of Culture. *Economic Geography*, 82(20).
- Markusen, A. (2006). Urban Development and the Politics of a Creative Class: Evidence from a Study of Artists. *Environment and Planning A*. 38 (10) pp. 1921-1940.
- Markusen A, Johnson A, 2006, "Artists' centres: evolution and impact on careers, neighborhoods and economies", Project on Regional and Industrial Economics, Humphrey Institute, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN, (Available at: http://www.hhh.umn.edu/img/assets/6158/artists_centers.pdf)
- Markusen, A., Schrock, G. (2006). The Artistic Dividend: Urban Artistic Specialization and Economic Development Implications. *Urban Studies*. 43 (10) pp. 1661-1668
- Pierce, P.W. (2008). Bridging, Bonding and Trusting: The Influence of Social Capital and Trust on Immigrants' Sense of Belonging to Canada. *Atlantic Metropolis Centre Working Paper Series Paper No. 18*, Atlantic Metropolis Centre, Available at: http://atlantic.metropolis.net/WorkingPapers/Pearce_WP18.pdf
- Peck, J. (2005). Struggling with the Creative Class. *International Journal of Urban Research*. 29 (4). pp. 740-770.
- Putnam, R. (2007). E Pluribus Unum: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-first Century, The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture. *Scandinavian Political Studies*, 30 (2), 137-174.

Smallbone, D., Bertotti, M., Ekanem, I. (2005). Diversification in Ethnic Minority Business: The Case of Asians in London's Creative Industries. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*. 12 (1) pp. 41-56.

Scott, A.J. (2006). Creative Cities: Conceptual Issues and Policy Questions. *Journal of Urban Affairs*. 28(1). pp 1-17.

Scott, A. J. (2007). Capitalism and Urbanization in an New Key? The Cognitive-Cultural Dimension. *Social Forces*. 85(4).

Thomas, J.M., Darnton, J. (2006). Social Diversity and Economic Development in the Metropolis. *Journal of Planning Literature*, 21 (153)

Wood, P., Landry, C. (2008). *The Intercultural City*. Earthscan: London.

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case Study Research Design and Methods Fourth Edition*. Sage Publications: California.