

Karin Kronstal and Jill L. Grant
School of Planning
Dalhousie University
Halifax, Nova Scotia

May 2010

Project Working Paper

Ethnic Diversity and Immigrant Integration in Halifax, Nova Scotia

Abstract:

Most newcomers to Canada move to Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver, the country's largest and most ethnically diverse cities. As small and medium sized cities experience population decline, governments have taken an interest in attracting and retaining immigrants to less popular destinations. This exploratory paper looks at research conducted in Halifax, Nova Scotia, a medium-sized city with a relatively small (7 percent) foreign-born population. The project looks at how two stakeholder groups -- civic officials and immigration service providers -- link population diversity and immigrant integration. We explore the different ways the groups conceptualize integration, and how they believe the presence or absence of co-ethnic communities facilitates or inhibits the integration process. In comparing the views of policy-makers with those working with immigrants, we found service providers challenged civic officials' understanding of integration and their assumptions about the role of diversity and 'culture' in immigrant attraction and retention.¹

¹ The authors gratefully acknowledge three grants that supported components of this research. Interviews with civic officials were conducted for the project *The Social Dynamics of Economic Performance*, an initiative from the Innovation Systems Research Network receiving a Major Collaborative Research Initiative Grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (2005-2011). Interviews with settlement service providers were conducted as part of a graduate thesis on immigration planning in Halifax (Kronstal 2009). Funding for this project was provided by the Atlantic Metropolis Pilot Grant (2009) and a Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council Graduate Research Scholarship (2009-2010).

Most newcomers to Canada settle in or around the major centres of Montreal, Vancouver or Toronto, now three of the world's most diverse cities. Despite the introduction of the Provincial Nominee Program, which allows provinces to direct selected applicants to their regions, 85 percent of newcomers continue to move to one of these three centres (Statistics Canada, 2006). Research finds the presence of ethnic communities second only to employment as a factor attracting new immigrants:

Opportunities in the fields of education and employment not surprisingly exist in greater number in larger, more diversified urban centres. The logic is tautological: making a place attractive to immigrants requires an existing immigrant population (Hyndman *et al.*, 2006, 19).

Attracting a diverse population has taken on increasing importance with the rise of the knowledge-based economy. In *The Rise of the Creative Class*, Richard Florida claims creative cities prosper by attracting talented workers. Florida uses the Mosaic Index, the percentage of foreign-born residents, as part of the calculation determining a city's "tolerance" level. Along with access to technology and other talented minds, creative workers seek tolerant environments and will move to cities that support these values (Florida, 2002a; 2005a; 2005b). Diversity, and the urban amenities that it is assumed to bring (such as ethnic restaurants and stores), is part of the package cities must provide to keep talented workers in place. For communities seeking to attract immigrants *and* creative workers, a poor ranking on the mosaic index seems an ominous sign indeed.

Several recent articles explore what Donald and Lewis call the "size-based discrimination" inherent in Florida's model, which relegates smaller cities to "have not" status in numerous categories (Donald and Lewis 2009, 4; See also Nelson 2004, Barrieau 2006). That tolerance is measured in part by the percentage of foreign-born residents provides a clear example of this unfairness: Since smaller cities attract fewer immigrants, they rarely attain the level of cosmopolitanism Florida presents as not only morally superior but mandatory for economic prosperity. Scholars point to other inconsistencies and inadequacies with the creative cities model. Some find the theory too focused on urban elites and argue its principles lead to increased income inequality and poor public spending (Peck, 2005, 2007; Sands and Reese, 2008). Moreover, even prior to the recent economic crisis, studies found that creative workers move where they can find work and not primarily because of social dynamics (Donegan *et al.*, 2008; Wolfe and Bramwell; 2008; Storper and Scott, 2009). The reality that communities large and small continue to follow Florida's advice in spite of uncertain outcomes speaks to the popular appeal of the creative cities concept.

The purpose of this paper is not to argue for or against the creative cities as a theory but to consider how the discourse shapes ideas about diversity and integration in a particular Canadian city-region. We analyzed how civic officials² in one medium-sized city believed the absence or presence of ethnic communities determines immigrant integration. We looked at how officials understand the term integration as it applies to

² Refers to persons employed by economic, social and cultural development agencies

immigrants, and then ask how this relates to the significance they attached to population diversity. We then compared the officials' views with those of service providers working directly with or on behalf of newcomers.

The two groups approached the subject from different perspectives: civic officials were more comfortable discussing the role of diversity in economic development, while the service providers focused on the everyday challenges faced by immigrants. In comparing the views, we found the discourse promoted by creative cities generates assumptions about immigrants' needs and desires that may not be appropriate to this particular city-region.

Study Context

Halifax Regional Municipality (HRM or Halifax) is the major centre of the Atlantic region, with a population of 372,858 dispersed over a large geographic area. HRM was created in 1996 when the province amalgamated the city of Halifax, the city of Dartmouth, the town of Bedford and the County of Halifax to create HRM. Halifax boasts a strong art and cultural scene and has produced well-known musicians (Grant et al. 2009). A study commissioned by the Greater Halifax Partnership, the economic development branch of HRM, ranked Halifax as the 4th city in Canada on the Talent Index (percentage of the population with a bachelor degree or higher), 7th on the Bohemian Index (proportion working in artistic and creative occupations), and 19th on the Mosaic Index of foreign-born (Gertler and Vinodrai, 2004). The Partnership brought Florida to Halifax in 2004 and adopted an explicit Floridian approach for its 2005-2010 municipal economic development plan, *Strategies for Success*.

This project follows up on data collected for a national research project, *The Social Dynamics of Economic Performance*. The study examines what conditions create effective leadership and collaboration between agencies working in different sectors of development. The objective of the study was to discover what linkages, if any, exist between community engagement and economic growth. The initial report on the topic of "Inclusive Communities and Civic Engagement" revealed contradictory dynamics in relationship Halifax respondents described between collaboration, diversity and economic growth (Grant and Kronstal 2009). On the one hand, civic officials found the city a difficult place for newcomers and criticized the dominant political culture as conservative and close-minded. Yet officials also valued the ability of stakeholders to collaborate across sectors and recognized that close, long-standing networks enable this working environment. In terms of immigration, most officials expressed a lack of familiarity with the challenges facing immigrants. One area of common concern was the perceived absence of co-ethnic communities for newcomers: that is, a community of people from the same region or language group. Many officials saw diversity as key to attracting and retaining immigrants, and expressed anxiety that Halifax's relative homogeneity may limit its social and economic development.

Overall, officials expressed a high level of satisfaction with the status quo in terms of collaborative activity between networks, but frustration with how newcomers are excluded. They discussed the dominant culture in negative terms (as conservative and exclusionary) but failed to acknowledge how these same dynamics may enable what they liked best about the city (its familiarity and collaboration). To further explore these tensions and gain a comparative perspective on the same issues, we compared these findings with data from interviews conducted with immigration service providers in Halifax.

Data Collection

The initial set of data (on Civic Officials) draws from the interviews conducted with civic officials during the summer of 2006. Researchers interviewed 27 respondents working for development agencies in the Halifax region. Approximately half (14) of the 27 respondents worked for economic development agencies, seven worked for cultural development agencies and four worked for social development agencies. One was an elected official in the Halifax region.

The comparative data set (of Service Providers) was collected in summer 2009 through interviews with 27 respondents who worked on behalf of or directly with immigrants to the Halifax Regional Municipality. Two-thirds (15) of the respondents were employed by non-governmental organizations providing immigration settlement services; a few of these specifically served international students or refugees. Seven respondents were employed by a government agency connected to immigration services, three were elected officials, and two were private citizens engaged in a volunteer capacity.

Given the different interests and expertise of these two groups, the interview guides covered a broad range of topics. We focus here on how stakeholders connected the themes of diversity, immigration and integration in three specific areas. First, how easily can newcomers integrate within the region? Second, what challenges do low levels of ethnic diversity create for attracting and retaining immigrants in Halifax? Third, how effectively do civic leaders respond to increasing diversity?

Focus Area 1: Newcomer Integration

Nearly everyone we spoke to (all service providers and three-quarters of civic officials) believed newcomers to Halifax, particularly immigrants, face significant barriers to integration. Those who had moved to the city reported that even non-immigrants find being a “Come-From-Away” (a term applying to anyone from outside the region) changed how they were perceived and treated by others. Newcomers from overseas may experience this more intensely, especially if English is not their first language. As respondents explained:

You're either from here or you're from away. It doesn't come up in conversation now, but when I first came here it came up with everyone I spoke to who knew I wasn't from here. So just multiply that by 100 or 1,000 if you're not from Canada and you don't fit the mould (Interview 23, federal elected official, settlement provider).

If you are a newcomer from the Maritimes, I think it is easy to integrate. If you are a newcomer from somewhere outside the Maritimes, it is somewhat more difficult. If you are an immigrant in the true sense of the word, it's not easy at all. I'm not proud to say that, but it's not easy (Interview 22, manager, provincial economic development, civic official).

Respondents pointed out that while Halifax may have a reputation as a friendly city, "We're very friendly as long as you're visiting. If you're staying there tends to be a lack of open arms" (Interview 3, municipal employee, settlement provider). Though government agencies have invested heavily in immigration over the past decade, many believed Haligonians do not demonstrate genuine openness to those perceived as outsiders. Civic officials in particular described Halifax as a politically conservative community:

New ideas are thought of negatively here. The first reaction is "no we can't do that", and the second reaction is um..."I don't think we should do that." New ideas, new anything here faces an uphill battle (Interview 17, staff, federal economic development).

We're slow here to embrace change. Everyone fears change, I think we're slow to do it, or we go into something whole-hog and don't know what the hell we're doing (Interview 5, manager, economic development association).

Some respondents rationalized exclusionary practices by portraying them as cultural norms. "It's not that we're not friendly, we just stick to our own a little bit" (Interview 20, manager, provincial economic development). Most recognized that while these networks often excluded newcomers, tight social relationships also facilitated collaboration. One staff member for an economic development association called his professional network "a blessing in the sense that you can pick up the phone and call people who work in different organizations who all know each other," but recognized it could be "very daunting for people who do come from other places" (Interview 4, civic official). This finding is consistent with earlier research on Halifax's creative class that found high levels of collaboration are one of the most attractive aspects of working in the city (Grant and Kronstal, forthcoming).

Settlement workers were less likely to see the positive aspects of in-group networks; many expressed frustration or disappointment that Nova Scotians seem reluctant to mix with immigrants. As one settlement worker who had moved to Halifax from overseas noted, "People here are friendly but never want to be your friend." Many attributed the perceived insularity of Nova Scotians to discomfort with racial or ethnic difference.

According to one NGO manager, the smaller number of diverse communities creates “a vicious circle where having fewer immigrants here means people have less exposure to immigrants and different cultures, which makes it much more difficult for people to become part of the culture” (Interview 13, service provider). While race is only one aspect in which newcomers may differ from the socio-cultural majority, a few respondents noted the history of racism towards the African Nova Scotian community may hold negative consequences for immigrants from African nations.

Settlement workers emphasized lack of access to professional opportunities as the primary barrier to retaining immigrants in Halifax. While cost of living, public safety and access to education are important, none of these were seen as sufficient without meaningful employment. Respondents repeatedly stressed that if immigrants choose to leave for larger cities, it is because people “tend to go where the jobs are and the jobs are in the bigger urban centres” (Interview 10, NGO, volunteer).

I see a lot of your families have moved to bigger centres like Toronto, Montreal, Vancouver or wherever. But most of them have said they didn't go because they liked it more than Halifax, they went for reasons like employment (Interview 11, NGO manager).

A respondent who had been involved in creating of the Provincial immigration strategy spoke about a 2003 conference that invited successful immigrants to Halifax to come and talk about why they stayed. The two factors identified were having a small network of co-ethnic support and, most critically, meaningful employment. “Really, everything else falls by the wayside. Great cultural opportunities, great recreational opportunities, great schools – none of those matter if the person cannot get employment. So the whole employment piece is the key aspect of it.” The respondent went on to emphasize how challenging this can be for newcomers to a smaller, fairly homogeneous community like Halifax, where “People have their network and their Rolodex. Looking for employment is more a matter of tapping your own contacts” (Interview 20, NGO Volunteer).

Other respondents provided a different view of how Halifax employers operate where getting a job depends not on knowing the right people but rather being the right kind of person: that is, familiar and local. The manager of an NGO used the image of three piles of resumes: one of young graduates from Halifax universities, a second from people who graduated then moved to Alberta and now want to come home, and a third from new immigrants. Even when the immigrants are the most qualified, “Only if employers haven't filled the jobs from the first two piles will they look at the last pile” (Interview 13, NGO manager). Another settlement worker provided a concrete example of an employer hiring a less qualified candidate over a newcomer (Interview 22, NGO employee).

My friend came here and got a degree but she couldn't get a job so she's moving back. Nobody would hire her as an English teacher so she got a part time job teaching ESL students in a private school. She had a conversation with a colleague who was teaching English literature in school. She asked him what was

his major and his major was biology. They would hire a Canada who had a Bachelor's degree in biology and not hire an immigrant woman who has two masters in English literature. That's the reality. You feel like you're devalued.

In sum, settlement workers and civic officials perceived Halifax as a difficult place for newcomers. Both stakeholders groups found access to meaningful employment limited by social dynamics such as in-group hiring preferences. Civic officials saw value in exclusionary social dynamics, while settlement providers were more likely to see in-group favouritism as discrimination.

Focus Area 2: Lack of Diversity and Immigrant Attraction/Retention

While civic officials and settlement workers agreed Halifax is a difficult place for newcomers, the two groups offered divergent views on whether the relatively low levels of ethnic diversity among the population deters immigrants from moving to or staying in the city.

Civic officials expressed anxiety about the city's ability to attract and retain immigrants and compared Halifax unfavourably with larger, more diverse cities. Noting Halifax does not have ethnic districts, the manager of a cultural development association stated, "Halifax doesn't have neighbourhoods. Toronto has a Portuguese neighbourhood, so if you come from Portugal and you move into that neighbourhood they help you to assimilate" (Interview 8, manager, cultural development association). Respondents downplayed existing communities, and those who identified ethnic groups with a presence in Halifax pointed to their limited number and size.

We're a pretty homogenous group. I know we have some large Italian communities and the Black communities, and Lebanese communities and Asian communities, but they're not very large. I don't think the province is very diverse (Interview 14, manager, provincial cultural development).

Civic officials offered two reasons why a more ethnically diverse Halifax would attract and retain greater numbers of immigrants. First, co-ethnic networks provide support during the settlement period and may offer opportunities for employment, both of which draw newcomers. Second, greater ethnic diversity create opportunities for non-immigrants to learn how to respond appropriately to cultural difference. Possibly because they had more experience dealing with the non-immigrant community than with newcomers, civic officials focused on the latter.

Respondents frequently referred to cultural differences as a barrier, particularly in the area of language. It is worth noting that three-quarters of immigrants entering the Province during the 2001-2006 period reported fluency in English, yet these officials cited language difference as a major barrier to employers hiring immigrants. A staff member for a cultural development organization attributed this to actual language difficulty but also employer bias:

There is a resistance or trepidation on the part of employers to bring somebody new into the office or an organization where language skills may present a challenge. The business community generally has a lack of cultural understanding what the means of newcomers are and what they can offer to the region (Interview 10, staff, cultural development association).

Officials saw host community failure to welcome newcomers appropriately as rooted in a culture gap between immigrant and non-immigrants. Many proposed a type of cultural shift as the most effective means for improving integration. As the manager of a provincial cultural development association put it, “Culture is the mechanism” (Interview 24). Respondents proposed different visions of a more cosmopolitan Halifax, progressing from an integrated city where cultures are shared freely to tolerant co-habitation.

It doesn't mean that we're going to say to Arabs, “you can't celebrate your culture, you have to celebrate our culture”, nor does it mean that we're going to say to them, “we're going to completely adopt your culture” (Interview 24, manager, provincial cultural development).

It isn't sufficient to just teach them about our culture, and integrate them into our culture –I think we need to give them a sense of belonging by allowing them to contribute to the community (Interview 14, staff, provincial social development).

In comparison to civic officials, service providers paid little attention to language and cultural differences between non-immigrants and immigrants. Most focused on barriers to economic integration such as absence of employment opportunities, lack of credential recognition or unfair hiring practices. These respondents proposed direct policy interventions such as paid work experience programs or instituting corporate diversity policies as an effective way of encouraging immigrants to stay in Halifax.

When asked about the role of co-ethnic communities during settlement most service providers believed that that while a small group of co-ethnic compatriots can be helpful to newcomers during the initial months, it isn't critical to long-term integration. One settlement agent working with international students stated, “If I just arrive I want my own people, but the longer I'm here the more I want to be integrated and know the other cultures as well” (Interview 9, NGO Manager). A provincial employee suggested immigrants see befriending Nova Scotians as a major integration milestone (Interview 1, Provincial government employee).

A few respondents noted that while ethnic communities may help co-ethnics find employment, not every community is similarly privileged. One federal elected official distinguished between ethnic communities who had “made it big” and those that are struggling. “Folks that are from ethnic or cultural groups that have a larger presence in Halifax may have access to more financial resources and networking opportunities. I see

the ease of navigation that comes from navigating Canadian society when there are other folks to rely on who have made their way” (Federal elected official, Interview 23).

Young professionals with spouses also seeking professional employment make up a large percentage of Halifax’s recent immigrants. The manager of an NGO noted the challenge of two professionals finding employment: “Sometimes [immigrants leave] when their spouse is offered a job with a very competitive salary.” The respondent recognizes the potential for family to draw immigrants from Halifax but reports that “the stories I’ve heard about immigrants leaving are 100% about being unable to find work” (Interview 2, NGO Manager). Data show that immigrants with relatives in Canada are more likely to leave the Atlantic region (Ramos et al., 2010).

Many of the service providers expressed a desire to see Halifax become a more diverse city, yet most saw the smaller size of the city as an attractive quality for newcomers.

People who are attracted to cities may overlook Halifax because they’re focused on the more “well known” cities or the larger ones, whereas Halifax can offer practically everything else that a large city offers. Of course everything is smaller scale here but smaller scale can also be healthier, it can be friendlier, it can be more peaceful, it’s much better for people who have children and it can potentially be safer. I think the city needs to exploit all of those things and use them in their favour (Interview 18, NGO Manager).

While nothing can compensate for lack of economic opportunity, respondents noted that a smaller community like Halifax may provide greater opportunities for socio-cultural integration. Neighbourhoods tend to be mixed, and centralized settlement services provide many opportunities to practice English with others and learn about diverse cultures. “I don’t think there will ever be mega-communities in Halifax. People can’t work in their first language and they can’t spend their whole life within their community and that’s a positive thing in terms of integrating” (Interview 13, NGO staff). A respondent working primarily with refugee claimants noted that clients often find themselves brought together by the small size of the community, despite political differences (Interview 16).

A nice thing about places the size of Halifax is that people realize here, when they’re away from their home country situation, they have more in common than not... There’s nothing like talking about the stuffed peppers from back home to unite people who have been fighting for thousands of years.

Settlement workers suggested the large number of universities in Halifax makes the city an appealing destination for families. One provincial elected official observed that since the introduction of the Provincial Nominee Program, Halifax has become a magnet for professionals with children. Many people immigrate despite having good jobs in their country of origin because they see Canada as providing opportunities for their children. “If they’ve chosen Halifax it’s because we have good schools and universities and they think it’s a good opportunity for their kids. They want to go to a place that has a lot of

support so their children will thrive” (Interview 2, provincial elected official, service provider).

Focus Area 3: How effectively do civic leaders respond to increasing population diversity?

Government efforts to promote immigration, particularly the introduction of the Provincial Nominee Program, led to moderate increases in immigrant retention rates (PNP Report 2008). We asked both stakeholder groups how effectively civic leaders have responded to this increasing diversity. Overall, service providers held more critical views of leadership. This confirms the difference between how service providers and civic officials perceive barriers; it may also indicate hesitancy on the part of civic officials to express strongly negative views about local leadership.

Civic officials introduced the idea that successful integration requires a culture shift. Effective civic leadership can bridge the culture gap by reaching out to immigrants, first by recognizing that the city *needs* immigrants to sustain growth, then by *welcoming* them to the community. Respondents described this as embracing diversity, though some were explicit about the pragmatism behind these gestures.

Civic leaders are embracing diversity because they’re told that’s what we need to do (Interview 1, manager, economic development association).

In the past couple of years, politicians have shown some leadership in embracing diversity because I think they learned that they need to in order for this community to grow and for us to attract the right types of companies that we want here (Interview 2, manager, economic development association).

Civic officials tended not to offer criticism of leadership but rather damned with faint praise, making comments such as “I don’t see them doing a negative job [responding to diversity]” (Interview 22, manager, provincial economic development). A sizeable minority (15%) said they didn’t know enough about the topic to answer the question, while others avoided responding by focusing on new government programs and policies. About one-third of respondents expressed dissatisfaction with leadership: “Politicians respond, but don’t go that extra mile. It’s one thing to say something, another thing to be visibly seen to doing it” (Interview 25, staff, provincial social development). Several suggested that lack of diversity among local elites hinders to their ability to “get it.”

We don’t see a lot of diversity in our City Council or our provincial government, not even gender...And that’s supposedly one of the easier ones. I don’t think that we have caught up yet with in terms of our diversity. Our civic leadership is not diverse. That’s probably one of the reasons why they don’t do a very good job of handling these issues (Interview 6, manager, social development association).

Diversity hasn’t been something that local politicians have taken on to actually become vocal about and support in the public eye. That is a tough one.

Individually, they have not responded not very well (Interview 23, staff, cultural development association).

In contrast to the tentative answers given by civic officials, service providers expressed strong dissatisfaction with civic leaders' responses to increasing diversity. They saw significant progress over the past decade, but stressed that much more remains to be done: “When you look at where the city was 10 years ago and where they are now they’re certainly further, but it still isn’t a deliberate, coordinated or integrated approach to welcoming newcomers” (Interview 13, NGO, staff). Among those interviewed only the elected officials framed an effective response in terms of promoting diversity, primarily as a symbolic gesture:

We do need more champions. Maybe it’s not that meaningful but I do think a lot of us who are in elected office should be cheerleaders: Raising it and talking about it to all of our community at different events is important (Interview 2, provincial elected official).

Settlement providers knew that civic leaders embraced immigration out of necessity, yet they appreciated the time and resources that different levels of government have invested in integration programs. They emphasized, however, that genuine interest in and openness to newcomers must accompany programs for them to be effective.

We’ve got to have our major employers and institutions step up and make the decision that we’re going to hire immigrants. Until we take that step forward and actually start hiring immigrants not much is going to happen (Interview 10, NGO Manager).

Some expressed frustration with the recent “buzz” around immigration that comes from the perception that immigrants are an economic boon. “We want immigration, we want newcomers – is there leadership? I don’t see it. I see it on the side of, ‘Okay, we want to be nice to immigrants so they’ll stay because we need people.’ But are we looking at the bigger picture? I don’t see the leadership on this issue” (Interview 13, NGO staff). The manager of a major NGO pointed out that while the City celebrates diversity on its website, these messages only appear on pages geared towards immigrants (Interview 13, NGO manager).

Not all service providers were frustrated by the economic motivations of civic officials. One individual involved in a policy summit to promote immigration recounts the pragmatic approach services providers took to get funding for the event:

My own personal view is that diversity is a good thing to pursue from different perspectives. But generally the people that I deal with are in government. Saying “Come share my values” isn’t really a persuasive business case so we principally pitched it in context to the economic and demographic challenges the province faces (Interview 20, NGO volunteer).

Whether they found it distasteful or not, most service providers saw the economic argument for immigration as a powerful tool for swaying politicians (and public opinion) in favour of immigration. However, some cautioned that pushing the image of the immigrant as economic engine may overlook sad realities. For example, several respondents mentioned the Kosovo refugees who arrived in Halifax in the 1990s as an example of a community that – in general – has not integrated well or achieved economic stability. While they may not support the narrative used to sell immigration to political leaders, these residents require as much consideration as more prosperous communities.

Service providers believed politicians pay insufficient attention to the needs of emerging communities, particularly for meeting space. Many current spaces for ethnic communities were built with private funds; the Lebanese community in particular invested heavily in community space. Halifax has several churches that serve specific communities, (e.g. Egyptian and Korean churches) and a new mosque currently under construction. Not all communities can afford to construct their own buildings. Service providers expressed concern about implications for the loss of traditions and languages for groups with nowhere to congregate.

It's really frustrating when you see kids who lose their Korean. They're not immigrants, they're Korean Canadians but they have family in Korea too so they want to connect themselves with Korea. I think we're talking about multiculturalism and not assimilating. When they have a centre they want to have a space where they can feel they're safe to practice their culture (Interview 22, NGO staff).

Another settlement worker sympathized with newcomers who lacked meeting space, observing that though she herself moved to Canada as a small child, she thought that giving up her connection to her cultural heritage would be a huge sacrifice. "I don't need it to find work, but I need it for my spirit" (Interview 11, NGO staff).

Discussion: What Does it Mean to Welcome Immigrants?

The discussion around immigrant attraction and retention in smaller cities focuses on the importance of creating a welcoming community for newcomers. In these interviews, we found stakeholders used the word welcoming to describe whatever action they perceived as meeting immigrants' greatest settlement needs. For civic officials, this meant encouraging *socio-cultural integration* by providing a positive social environment and opportunities for cultural dialogue.

We don't have a Chinatown; we don't have those critical masses of ethnic communities, so we need to realize that. There is going to be 30 to 40 percent of immigrants that decide to move on for their own reasons, but the other ones we really need to make them feel welcome (Interview 21, manager, provincial economic development).

Settlement workers, by contrast, envisioned a welcoming community as centred on *economic integration* enabled by equitable opportunities for employment and services. A welcoming community is one where new residents can find meaningful work commensurate with their skills and experience, regardless of where they come from.

A welcoming community is one where people have services that are accessible to them. It means that as an employer, they're open to hiring immigrants. That's the number one. It's like Maslow's theory. If you can't work, you can't feed your children – food, shelter, and clothing are the basics. One immigrant said to me, "If I can't find a job then this is not a welcoming community" (Interview 1, Provincial elected official).

One possible conclusion from this research is that civic officials and service hold *conflicting* views on several topics related to integration, particularly on what draws and keeps newcomers in the city. An alternative conclusion is that the groups offer *complementary* perspectives: Successful settlement involves changes to the economic and socio-cultural dynamics of place. Economic opportunity may be a *necessary* condition for attracting and keeping immigrants in Halifax (the point highlighted by service providers, but it may not be *sufficient* (the subject stressed by civic officials). As Halifax becomes a more diverse and open city then civic leaders can move beyond welcoming newcomers by meeting their social, cultural and economics needs.

References

- Agrawal, S., Andrew, C., and Biles, J. (2009). 'Introduction Welcoming Communities: Planning for the Diversity in Canadian Cities' *Plan Canada* 49, 4-5.
- Barrieau, N. (Summer 2006). 'Creative Class and Economic Development: The Case of Atlantic Canada's Urban Centres' *Our Diverse Cities* (2), 140-145.
- Donald, B and Lewis, N. (2009). 'A New Rubric for 'Creative City,' Potential in Canada's Smaller Cities' *Urban Studies OnlineFirst* 1-26.
- Donegan, M., Dricker, J., Goldstein H., Lowe N., and Malizia, E. (2008.) 'Which indicators explain metropolitan economic performance best? Traditional or creative class' *Journal of the American Planning Association* 74(2), 180-195.
- Gertler, M. and Vinodrai, T. (2004). *Competing on Creativity: Focus on Halifax*. A report prepared for the Greater Halifax Partnership (Available at: http://www.greaterhalifax.com/site-ghp2/media/Parent/Competing_on_Creativity_Focus_on_Halifax.pdf, accessed 8 March 2009)

Grant, J.L, Haggett, J. and Morton J., (2009) 'The Halifax Sound: Live Music and the Economic Development in Halifax.' Available at http://www.suburbs.planning.dal.ca/Docs/Creative%20Halifax/Halifax_Sound_Final.pdf.

Grant, J.L. and Kronstal, K. (forthcoming). 'The Social Dynamics of Attracting Talent in Halifax' *The Canadian Geographer*.

----. (2009) 'Theme 3: Inclusive Communities and Civic Engagement.' Available at <http://www.suburbs.planning.dal.ca/Docs/theme%203%20Halifax%20summary%203%20Aug%2009.pdf>

Florida, R. (2002a). *The Rise of the Creative Class and How it's Transforming Work, Leisure, Community, and Everyday Life* (New York: Basic Books)

----. (2005a) *Cities and the Creative Class* (New York: Routledge)

----. (2005b) *The Flight of the Creative Class: The New Global Competition for Talent* (New York: Harper Business, Harper Collins)

Hyndman, J., Schuurman, N. and Fiedler, R. (2006) 'Size matters: attracting new immigrants to Canadian cities' *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 7(1), 1–25.

Nelson, R. (2005). "A Cultural Hinterland?: Searching for the Creative Class in the Small Canadian City," in W.F. Garrett-Petts (ed.), *The Small Cities Book: On the Cultural Future of Small Cities*. (Vancouver, B.C., New Star Books)

Peck, J. (2005). 'Struggling with the creative class.' *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 29(4), 740-770.

Peck J. (2007). 'Banal urbanism: cities and the creativity fix' *Monu*, 7, 36–47.

Sands G. and Reese L.A., (2008). 'Cultivating the creative class: and what about Nanaimo?' *Economic Development Quarterly* 22(1), 8–23.

Statistics Canada. (2006) 'Citizenship, Place of Birth, Sex and Immigrant Status and Period of Immigration for the Population of Canada, Provinces, Territories, Census Metropolitan Areas and Census Agglomerations, 2006 Census - 20% Sample Data'. Catalogue #97-557-XCB2006008 (Ottawa: Statistics Canada).

Storper M. and Scott J. (2009) Rethinking human capital, creativity and urban growth' *Journal of Economic Geography* 9, 147-167.

Wolfe D. and Bramwell A. (2008) 'Innovation, creativity and governance: social dynamics of economic performance in city-regions' *Innovation: management, policy and practice* 10, 170-182.